



# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE

United States Patent and Trademark Office

Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS

P.O. Box 1450

Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450

www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/851,483	05/08/2001	Jack J. Johnson	113071.129-US1	3783
28089 7590 01/29/2008 WILMERHALE/NEW YORK 399 PARK AVENUE NEW YORK, NY 10022				
EXAMINER				
OYEBISI, OJO O				
ART UNIT		PAPER NUMBER		
3694				
NOTIFICATION DATE		DELIVERY MODE		
01/29/2008		ELECTRONIC		

**Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.**

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

Notice of the Office communication was sent electronically on above-indicated "Notification Date" to the following e-mail address(es):

michael.mathewson@wilmerhale.com

teresa.carvalho@wilmerhale.com

sharon.matthews@wilmerhale.com

### Office Action Summary

**Application No.**

09/851,483

**Applicant(s)**

JOHNSON ET AL.

**Examiner**

OJO O. OYEBISI

**Art Unit**

3694

**-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --**  
**Period for Reply**

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

**Status**

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 11/13/07.
- 2a) ☒ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☐ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

**Disposition of Claims**

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 46-51, 53-67, 69-71, 82-88, 90-103, 118-121 and 123 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 12, 46-51, 53-67, 69-71, 82-88, 90-103 and 118-121 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) \_\_\_\_\_ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

**Application Papers**

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on \_\_\_\_\_ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.  
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).  
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

**Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119**

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some \* c) ☐ None of:
1. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
  2. ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. \_\_\_\_\_.
  3. ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

\* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

**Attachment(s)**

- 1) ☐ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
- 2) ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
- 3) ☐ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08)  
Paper No(s)/Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_
- 4) ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413)  
Paper No(s)/Mail Date \_\_\_\_\_
- 5) ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application
- 6) ☐ Other: \_\_\_\_\_

## DETAILED ACTION

### *Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103*

1. The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.
2. Claims 46-51, 53-67, 69-71, 82-88, 90-103, 118-121, and 123 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Taylor et al (Taylor hereinafter, US PAT:5,790,642) in view of Harrington (US PAT: 6161099).

**Re claims 46.** Taylor discloses a method for creating a bidding process among telecommunication providers in which a moderating computer collects bids from at least two telecommunication providers, processes the bids and designates at least one provider of the at least two telecommunication providers to provide telecommunication service (i.e., In general however, assemble bid request block 403 will generate a data structure which includes all of the information required by the bidding service center, previously described in order to generate their respective bids, see col.7 lines 50-col.8 line 30);

a. in the Moderating computer, receiving the bids to provide telecommunication service over at least one route, or at least one route segment, on at least one telecommunication network, processing the bids to produce processed bid data,

c. in the Moderating computer, designating at least one Provider of the least two telecommunication providers as a first designated provider to provide telecommunication service over the at least one route or the at least one route segment, on at least one telecommunication network (i.e., After the bid request is transmitted, the originating service center then awaits arrival of the bids from the respective bidding service centers. First, the bid timer and bid counter (explained more fully later herein) are both initialized at block 405. The bid timer and bid counter are intended to inform the originating service center if and when it has all of the information from the other bidding centers which it needs to award the job to the lowest cost service center. Specifically, and by way of example, the originating service center should award the job to the lowest bidding service center when any of the following occurs (i) it has received the bids from all of the service centers; (ii) the maximum time to receive such bids has expired, even if all bids have not yet been received or (iii) any bid is received which is below a predetermined threshold which is deemed low enough to be acceptable. Turning to decision point 406, the bid time is calculated to be the roundtrip time for the bid request to be transmitted from the originating center to all of the bidding centers, and for the bidding centers to return their bids to the originating center, see col.8 lines 1-65, also see col.9 lines 1-35),

d. in a computer adjunct to at least one telecommunication switch, performing at least a portion of the processing or communication functions of the moderating computer (see col.4 lines 10-50). Taylor does not explicitly disclose b. in the Moderating computer, transmitting at least a portion of the first bidding data to at least a portion of the at least

two telecommunication Providers and "storing the bids and the processed bid data in a data base of the Moderating computer as first bidding data." However, Harrington discloses transmitting at least a portion of the first bidding data to at least a portion of the at least two telecommunication Providers (i.e., after the user selects the submit button and the bid is verified as conforming to the bid parameters, the bidder is presented with a confirmation screen, .... to confirm the bid prior to submission, a summary of the bid is presented to the user in this confirmation. if confirmed, the bid will be electronically submitted to the auctioneer computer, note that in Harrington as long the auction is still open the bidders can retrieve previously submitted bid data and resubmit such bid data, see col.10 line 42 – col.11 line 5, also note that bidders as disclosed by Harrington constitute the telecommunication providers as disclosed by the applicant). Harrington further discloses "storing the bids and the processed bid data in a data base (i.e., The auctioneer's computer also maintains a database of all bids which can be accessed by interested parties for their own use, see col.5 lines 37-42). Thus, it would have been obvious to combine the teachings of Taylor and Harrington to make sure that telecommunication service providers are properly compensated for the services they produce and to allow the telecommunication service providers to correct the current proposed bid.

**Re claims 47-49.** Taylor further discloses a method in which the processed bid data includes Provider designation data (i.e., Returning to FIG. 3, control is then transferred to parse bid request 304 in which the necessary data for costing the telephone call is extracted from the appropriate fields of bid request, see col.7 lines 26-30, also see "In

general however, assemble bid request block 403 will generate a data structure which includes all of the information required by the bidding service center", see col.7 lines 60-65).

**Re claim 50.** Taylor further discloses a method in which the moderating computer, or a computer adjunct to the moderating computer transmits at least a portion of the Provider designation data to at least one telecommunication switch or to a computer adjunct to the at least one telecommunication switch, for use in routing at least one call attempt (i.e., After the bid request is transmitted, the originating service center then awaits arrival of the bids from the respective bidding service centers. First, the bid timer and bid counter (explained more fully later herein) are both initialized at block 405. The bid timer and bid counter are intended to inform the originating service center if and when it has all of the information from the other bidding centers which it needs to award the job to the lowest cost service center, see col.8 lines 1-20, also see co.3 lines 5-20, also see the abstract).

**Re claim 51.** Taylor further discloses a method in which the first designated Provider is a default Provider or a contract Provider (see col.10 lines 10-28).

**Re claim 53.** Taylor discloses a method for creating a bidding process among telecommunication providers in which a moderating computer collects bids from at least two telecommunication providers, processes the bids and designates at least one provider of the at least two telecommunication providers to provide telecommunication service (i.e., In general however, assemble bid request block 403 will generate a data

Art Unit: 3694

structure which includes all of the information required by the bidding service center, previously described in order to generate their respective bids, see col.7 lines 60-66);

a. in the Moderating computer, receiving the bids to provide telecommunication service over at least one route, or at least one route segment, on at least one

telecommunication network, processing the bids to produce processed bid data,

c. in the Moderating computer, designating at least one Provider of the least two telecommunication providers as a first designated provider to provide

telecommunication service over the at least one route or the at least one route segment, on at least one telecommunication network

d. in the moderating computer, transmitting provider designation data to at least one telecommunication switch (see col.4 lines 10-50), and

e. in the at least one telecommunication switch, routing at least one call attempt in accordance with the provider designation data (i.e., After the bid request is transmitted, the originating service center then awaits arrival of the bids from the respective bidding service centers. First, the bid timer and bid counter (explained more fully later herein) are both initialized at block 405. The bid timer and bid counter are intended to inform the originating service center if and when it has all of the information from the other bidding centers which it needs to award the job to the lowest cost service center.

Specifically, and by way of example, the originating service center should award the job to the lowest bidding service center when any of the following occurs (i) it has received the bids from all of the service centers; (ii) the maximum time to receive such bids has expired, even if all bids have not yet been received or (iii) any bid is received which is

below a predetermined threshold which is deemed low enough to be acceptable.

Turning to decision point 406, the bid time is calculated to be the roundtrip time for the bid request to be transmitted from the originating center to all of the bidding centers, and for the bidding centers to return their bids to the originating center, see col.8 lines 1-65, also see col.9 lines 1-35). Taylor does not explicitly disclose b. in the Moderating computer, transmitting at least a portion of the first bidding data to at least a portion of the at least two telecommunication Providers and "storing the bids and the processed bid data in a data base of the Moderating computer as first bidding data." However, Harrington discloses transmitting at least a portion of the first bidding data to at least a portion of the at least two telecommunication Providers (i.e., after the user selects the submit button and the bid is verified as conforming to the bid parameters, the bidder is presented with a confirmation screen, .... to confirm the bid prior to submission, a summary of the bid is presented to the user in this confirmation. if confirmed, the bid will be electronically submitted to the auctioneer computer, note that in Harrington as long the auction is still open the bidders can retrieve previously submitted bid data and resubmit such bid data, see col.10 line 42 – col.11 line 5, also note that bidders as disclosed by Harrington constitute the telecommunication providers as disclosed by the applicant). Harrington further discloses "storing the bids and the processed bid data in a data base (i.e., The auctioneer's computer also maintains a database of all bids which can be accessed by interested parties for their own use, see col.5 lines 37-42). Thus, it would have been obvious to combine the teachings of Taylor and Harrington to make sure that telecommunication service providers are properly compensated for the



services they produce and to allow the telecommunication service providers to correct the current proposed bid.

**Re claims 54-55.** Taylor further discloses a method in which the Provider designation data includes designation of at least one alternate Provider (i.e., "In general however, assemble bid request block 403 will generate a data structure which includes all of the information required by the bidding service center", see col.7 lines 60-65).

**Re claim 56.** Taylor further discloses a method including, in the moderating computer, transmitting at least a portion of the first bidding data to at least one end user or to at least one 10 reseller (see abstract).

**Re claims 57 and 58.** Taylor further discloses a method comprising, in the moderating computer, receiving decision rules from an administrator associated with the moderating computer or from an administrator associated with at least one subscribing switch or from at least one end user or from at least one reseller, processing at least a portion of the first bidding data and at least a portion of the decision rules, and designating at least the first designated Provider for the provision of telecommunication service (i.e., if one or more of the bidding service centers submits a bid, the originating service compares the bids and awards the bids to the best bidder, see col.8 lines 60-65, also see col.8 line 17-col.9 line12, see fig.4a and 4b).

**Re claim 59.** Taylor further discloses a method in which the first designated Provider is a default Provider or a contract Provider (see col.10 lines 22-30).

**Re claim 60.** Taylor further discloses a method in which one or more adjunct computers perform at least a portion of the processing or communications functions of the

moderating computer or the at least one telecommunication switch (see col.4 lines 10-50).

**Re claim 61.** Taylor further discloses a method in which the moderating computer or the at least one telecommunication switch is operated by a local access telecommunication service provider (see fig.1).

**Re claim 62.** Taylor further discloses a method comprising, in the moderating computer, processing the bids in accordance with bidding rules to produce processed bid data (see col.8 lines 17-66)

**Re claim 63.** Claim 63 recites similar limitations to claim 53 above and thus rejected using the same art and rejection as in claim 53.

**Re claim 64.** Taylor further discloses a method in which the first portion of the first switch data is the same as the second portion of the first switch data, or in which the first portion includes the second portion of the first switch data, or in which the first portion is included in the second portion of the first switch data (i.e., The information may be transmitted back in the form of any convenient data structure, but ideally only occupies a few bytes and results in extremely minimal overhead, see col.5 lines 10-17)

**Re claim 65.** Taylor further discloses a method in which the moderating computer is a computer adjunct to the first subscribing switch (i.e., center 102, see fig.1)

**Re claim 66.** Taylor further discloses a method in which the first subscribing switch is operated by the moderating computer, or by an administrator associated with the moderating computer, or by at least one end user, or by at least one reseller, or by a

local access telecommunication service provider (i.e., a plurality of service centers, see abstract, see col.4 lines 24-26, also see fig.1).

**Re claim 67.** Taylor further discloses a method comprising, in the first subscribing switch, receiving decision rules from an administrator associated with the moderating computer or from an administrator associated with the first subscribing switch or from at least one end user or from at least one reseller, processing at least the second portion of the first switch data and at least a portion of the decision rules, and designating at least the first designated Provider for the provision of telecommunication service (see fig.4a and 4b, also see col.8 line 17-col.9 line12).

**Re claim 69.** Taylor further discloses a method in which the first subscribing switch designates at least one alternate Provider (i.e., service centers can subcontract out the job by competitively bidding it among a plurality of local nodes, see col.10 lines 23-30).

**Re claim 70.** Taylor further discloses a method in which the moderating computer or the first subscribing switch transmits at least the first portion of the first switch data to at least a portion of the at least two telecommunication Providers subsequent to the first subscribing switch designating the first designated Provider to provide telecommunication service (i.e., In general however, assemble bid request block 403 will generate a data structure which includes all of the information required by the bidding service center, previously described in order to generate their respective bids. Once the bid request is assembled, it is transmitted to the bidding service center at block 404. After the bid request is transmitted, the originating service center then awaits

Art Unit: 3694

arrival of the bids from the respective bidding service centers, see col.7 line 60-col.8 line 3).

**Re claim 71.** Taylor further discloses a method in which at least a portion of the processing or communications functions of the moderating computer or the first subscribing switch is performed by one or more adjunct computers (see col.4 lines 10-50).

**Re claims 82-83.** Claims 82-83 recite similar limitations to claim 53 and thus rejected using the same art and rationale as in claim 53 supra.

**Re claim 84.** Claim 84 recites similar limitations to claim 64 and thus rejected using the same art and rationale as in claim 64 supra.

**Re claim 85.** Claim 85 recites similar limitations to claim 70 and thus rejected using the same art and rationale as in claim 70 supra.

**Re claim 86.** Claim 86 recites similar limitations to claim 50 and thus rejected using the same art and rationale as in claim 50 supra.

**Re claim 87.** Taylor further discloses a method in which at least a portion of the bidding process of Steps a. through f. is conducted in accordance with bidding rules (see col.8 lines 17-66).

**Re claim 88.** Claim 88 recites similar limitations to claim 53 and thus rejected using the same art and rationale as in claim 53 supra.

**Re claims 90-91.** Taylor further discloses a method in which the Provider designation data includes designation of the first designation provider (i.e., Returning to FIG. 3, control is then transferred to parse bid request 304 in which the necessary data for

costing the telephone call is extracted from the appropriate fields of bid request, see col.7 lines 26-30, also see "In general however, assemble bid request block 403 will generate a data structure which includes all of the information required by the bidding service center", see col.7 lines 60-65).

**Re claim 92.** Claim 92 recites similar limitations to claim 50, and thus rejected using the same art and rationale as in claim 50 supra.

**Re claim 93.** Taylor further discloses a method in which the designating of the first designated Provider is performed by the moderating computer, by the at least one telecommunication switch , by the computer adjunct to the moderating computer, or by the computer adjunct to the at least one telecommunication switch (i.e., if one or more of the bidding service centers submits a bid, the originating service compares the bids and awards the bids to the best bidder see col.8 lines 60-65, also see col.8 line 17-col.9 line12, see fig.4a and 4b)

**Re claim 94.** Taylor further discloses a method in which at least a portion of the processed bid information is distributed to at least a portion of the at least two telecommunication Providers subsequent to the designating of the first designated Provider to provide telecommunication service (i.e., In general however, assemble bid request block 403 will generate a data structure which includes all of the information required by the bidding service center, previously described in order to generate their respective bids. Once the bid request is assembled, it is transmitted to the bidding service center at block 404. After the bid request is transmitted, the originating service

center then awaits arrival of the bids from the respective bidding service centers, see col.7 line 60-col.8 line 3, also see fig.4a element 414, also see fig.4b element 416).

**Re claim 95.** Claim 95 recites similar limitations to claim 87, and thus rejected using the same art and rationale as in claim 87 supra.

d in accordance with bidding rules.

**Re claim 96.** Taylor further discloses a method in which each of Steps a. - f. is accomplished by means of computer processing (see fig.1).

**Re claim 97.** Claim 97 recites similar limitations to claim 57, and thus rejected using the same art and rationale as in claim 57 supra.

**Re claims 98-101.** Taylor discloses the generation of a bid request data, transmission of the request data, and the reception of said request data (see fig.3, also col.4 line 60-col.5 line10), but discloses not explicitly how this bid request data is generated i.e., Taylor does not explicitly disclose a method in which the Buyer submits the request to a moderating computer by entering request data into a first software defined template residing on a computer bulletin board system, or on a website. However, data entry into a software template on a website is old and well known in the art. Thus it would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art to incorporate what is old and well into Taylor to provide a remote platform for buyer to put in their request.

**Re claims 102-103.** Taylor does not explicitly disclose a method in which a moderating computer, or a computer adjunct to the moderating computer, distributes at least a portion of the processed bid information to at least a portion of the at least two telecommunication Providers. However, Harrington discloses transmitting at least a

portion of the first bidding data to at least a portion of the at least two telecommunication Providers (i.e., after the user selects the submit button and the bid is verified as conforming to the bid parameters, the bidder is presented with a confirmation screen, .... to confirm the bid prior to submission, a summary of the bid is presented to the user in this confirmation. if confirmed, the bid will be electronically submitted to the auctioneer computer, note that in Harrington as long the auction is still open the bidders can retrieve previously submitted bid data and resubmit such bid data, see col.10 line 42 – col.11 line 5, also note that bidders as disclosed by Harrington constitute the telecommunication providers as disclosed by the applicant). Thus, it would have been obvious to combine the teachings of Taylor and Harrington to make sure that telecommunication service providers are properly compensated for the services they produce and to allow the telecommunication service providers to correct the current proposed bid.

**Re claims 118-121, and 123.** Taylor further discloses a Moderator including means for distributing the processed request to at least a portion of the plurality of telecommunication Providers (i.e., In general however, assemble bid request block 403 will generate a data structure which includes all of the information required by the bidding service center, previously described in order to generate their respective bids. Once the bid request is assembled, it is transmitted to the bidding service center at block 404. After the bid request is transmitted, the originating service center then awaits arrival of the bids from the respective bidding service centers, see col.7 line 60-col.8 line 3, also see fig.4a element 414, also see fig.4b element 416) except for posting the

processed request on a computer bulletin board system or on a website accessible to at least a portion of the plurality of telecommunication Providers. However, data entry into a software template on a website and posting of said data online is old and well known in the art. Thus it would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art to incorporate what is old and well into Taylor to provide a remote platform for providers to see the outcome of their bidding.

### ***Response to Arguments***

Applicant's arguments filed 11/13/07 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive. Applicant argues in substance that Taylor fails to disclose transmission of "bidding data." Contrary to the applicant's assertion, Taylor discloses transmission of "bidding data" (i.e., In general however, assemble bid request block 403 will generate a data structure which includes all of the information required by the bidding service center, previously described in order to generate their respective bids. Once the bid request is assembled, it is transmitted to the bidding service center at block 404. After the bid request is transmitted, the originating service center then awaits arrival of the bids from the respective bidding service centers, see col.7 line 60-col.8 line 20). Note that Taylor mentions that the originating service center then awaits arrival of the bids from the respective bidding service centers, thus the bids must have been transmitted for the bids to have been received by the originating service center.

The applicant further argues that Taylor fails to disclose the transmission of the "bidding data" to at least two telecommunication providers. This argument is moot



in view of new ground of rejection stated in claim 46 supra (see the rejection of claim 46 supra).

***Conclusion***

**THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL.** Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire THREE MONTHS from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within TWO MONTHS of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after the end of the THREE-MONTH shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than SIX MONTHS from the mailing date of this final action.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to OJO O. OYEBISI whose telephone number is (571)272-8298. The examiner can normally be reached on 8:30A.M-5:30P.M.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, JAMES TRAMMELL can be reached on (571)272-6712. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Art Unit: 3694

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

/James P Trammell/  
Supervisory Patent Examiner, Art Unit 3694

\*\*\*